2022 Converged TV Measurement & Data Summit Summary

February 16 + 17, 2022

WELCOME: Industry Progress Report

Jon Watts, the incoming Managing Director of CIMM (subsidiary of the ARF) welcomed attendees to the virtual 11th Annual Converged TV Measurement & Data Summit. In his opening remarks he provided an industry status report, highlighting that 2022 is a year of change with no accredited converged TV measurement provider, Nielsen zero-basing its measurement starting next year, new solutions being tested by buyers and sellers, and multiple industry measurement initiatives. He highlighted CIMM's unique role as a non-partisan, cross-industry alliance; and outlined ambitious new plans to support members with new forums, research projects, and initiatives. He emphasized the value that has come from his Listening Tour of members and industry executives, and encouraged feedback from all Summit attendees.

OPENING FIRESIDE CHAT: Roadmap to Converged TV Measurement

Jeanine Poggi, Editor, Ad Age interviewed Krishan Bhatia, President and Chief Business Officer of Global Advertising & Partnerships, NBCUniversal. Krishan began by emphasizing that viewing of ad-supported streaming and ad-supported linear is larger than viewing of streaming services with no ads, making the point that ads are still very important to networks. He also said that more than one third of viewing to NBCU's properties is on streaming platforms, with 50% expected soon. These findings emphasize the need for NBCU to accurately reflect consumption on all distribution platforms to better serve the needs of marketers.

When Jeanine asked how the market can handle multiple currencies, Krishan made the point that digital media transacts on multiple currencies now, and that NBCU already uses multiple currencies in TV measurement, including the use of Comcast's STB data for selling advanced audiences and also for some deals taking place through industry consortium OpenAP. He said that 1/3 of last year's TV Upfront was already transacted without using Nielsen data alone. Krishan spoke about the extensive measurement RFP conducted by NBCU over the past year to identify measurement partners in six different areas, with eight "currency contenders," and highlighted findings from iSpot's measurement of the Olympics and the SuperBowl.

BUILDING BLOCKS FOR CONVERGED TV MEASUREMENT:
Creating Scaled & Representative "Currency-Grade" TV Datasets

Howard Shimmel, President, Janus Strategy & Insights moderated a panel representing the heads of research or product at the vendors who are creating "currency-grade" converged TV measurement solutions, including Josh Chasin, Chief Measurability Officer, VideoAmp; Michael Vinson, Chief Research Officer, Comscore; Caroline Hormner, Chief Product Officer, 605; Mainak Mazumdar, Chief Data & Research Officer, Nielsen; and Vijoy Gopalakrishnan, Chief Research Officer at iSpot. Howard opened by calling the panel a "master class" in data management, and that he hoped to illuminate the reasons why different suppliers produce different results. Panelists generally agreed that no single data source can

capture even linear TV viewing accurately today, much less the inclusion of streaming on TVs. The panelists enumerated numerous Smart TV and STB datasets they're combining with panel data and other metadata, that is then calibrated via data science models.

When discussing what is needed in current solutions, Caroline pointed out the need to measure all TV sets in a home and for vendors to use a common set of Universe Estimates for different types of TV households as well as channel distribution; Vijoy emphasized the necessity to deliver data speedily, especially for ads to help marketers optimize campaigns; Mainak reiterated the importance of reporting on people-based measurements, not just machines that may not have anyone in front of them; Michael emphasized the skills needed to make accurate inferences based on data science models and also to understand sources of error; and Josh pointed out that streamers have the most accurate census data for their platforms, so vendors need to coordinate with them to appropriately permission the use of these data in third-party measurement solutions.

BUILDING BLOCKS FOR CONVERGED TV MEASUREMENT:
Standardizing Digital Census Data for Content & Ads

Todd Bender SVP, Ad Platforms, Paramount (formerly called ViacomCBS) moderated a panel of digital measurement providers including James Lamberti, Chief Marketing Officer, Conviva; Jonathan Whitticom, Chief Product Officer, Freewheel, A Comcast Company; Tal Chalozin, CTO & Co-Founder, Innovid; and Prema Sempath, Group Product Manager, Measurement, Google. Todd described the technical and business model complexity that networks encounter with distributing their content across so many different platforms. He made the point that it results in inconsistency in the data that is provided back to the network.

Jon emphasized that technology challenges should be resolved first, including standardization of reporting metrics and common IDs. This has to be separated from business challenges. Prema shared Google's position, which is to build all solutions with consumer privacy protection as paramount, which often requires data to be grouped by cohort or context. James offered that the census data provided by Conviva for both content and ads could provide a standardized approach to measurement, if the networks provide the appropriate permissions. Tal recommended that all industry players adopt the IAB's VAST (Video Ad Serving Template) standard, including the standardized metadata it provides.

UPDATE ON INDUSTRY INITIATIVES: Progress Report

Jon Watts moderated a panel of executives leading various industry measurement initiatives, including Kelly Abcarian, EVP, Measurement & Impact, Advertising & Partnerships, NBCUniversal Media; Nathalie Bordes, EVP, Measurement for Marketers, the ANA; Sean Cunningham, President & CEO, VAB; and George Ivie, CEO, Executive Director, Media Rating Council. Nathalie provided an update on the ANA's testing of the WFA's Virtual ID Model with VideoAmp and Comscore, in additional to their testing with OpenAP. She made the point that marketers are still struggling with their top priority of deduplicating reach and managing frequency in cross-media campaigns that include different forms of TV and big digital platforms such as Google and Facebook.

Kelly offered the NBCU Look Book of the eight "currency contenders" to bring transparency to the new measurement solutions. She also emphasized the importance for marketers of measuring ads separately from content, and the need to report standard error around audience estimates – which isn't a current industry practice. Sean pointed out that prior to 2021, the VAB had primarily been a generator of insights about multi-platform TV, but at the direction of their members, have become a whistleblower to expose issues with the Nielsen currency. He emphasized that his Measurement Innovation Task Force is collaborating with all members including NBCU, and also with the MRC to accredit new vendors and with the ANA to link TV measurement with that of large digital platforms in privacy-compliant ways. George pointed out that many of the new vendors have reached out to the MRC, or are already in the early stages of auditing their products. He emphasized the steps that need to be taken to go deeper

than the NBCU Look Book to examine the coverage each vendor provides of all platforms, as well as to bring full disclosure to statistical methods and any "secret sauce" of each vendor.

HOW TO INCORPORATE "QUALITY METRICS" INTO CROSS-MEDIA MEASUREMENT:
Buyer and Seller POV

Scott McDonald, President & CEO of the Advertising Research Foundation moderated the closing panel for Day 1. His panelists included Radha Subramanyam, Chief Research & Analytics Officer, CBS Corporation and President, CBS Vision; Bharad Ramesh, Executive Director, Research & Investment Analytics, GroupM; and Tina Daniels, Managing Director, Agency & Brand Measurement Analytics, Google. Scott began by clarifying that the panel will focus on metrics associated with the quality of the media environment and not the quality of ads. He also encouraged the panel not to fall back on general assessments of "knowing quality when you see it."

Radha listed three types of metrics: 1) those that are relatilvely clearcut and easier to measure, such as video starts, duration of ad exposure, and whether the sound is on or off; 2) measures of context that can be somewhat more subjective, such as whether the program is professionally produced vs. generated by consumers and if the content provides a brand-safe environment for particular ads; and 3) metrics that are more subjective and not as easy to measure such as attention, and the relative "quality" of either the content or the ad.

Bharad pointed out that ad placement is a decision made on a client-by-client basis, and that every client has their own method to assess the value of each impression and certain thresholds they're willing to accept. He emphasized that this is also different depending whether the goal of the campaign is for branding vs. performance. Tina said that brand safety is foundational for most marketers, and that we have the ability to describe quality environments across many dimensions. She also encouraged the industry not to settle for the lowest common denominator in order to make comparisons across media.

DAY 2: Thursday, February 17: 12:00-2:00pm

WELCOME & UPDATE ON CIMM'S GUIDE TO CONVERGED TV MEASUREMENT PROVIDERS:
Status Report

Jon Watts opened Day 2 by providing an update on CIMM's Guide to Convergent TV Measurement. He reviewed that the project was launched in November 2021 with the goal of unpacking the differences between new "currency-grade" solutions for converged TV measurement. An RFI for the vendors was developed with input from CIMM members, with the draft send to eight vendors in early February. However, once the NBCU Look Book was published, it became clear that there was some overlap in content, so a new plan has been developed to dig deeper into the methodology of each vendor ro complement the Look Book. Areas to cover include clear definitions of impressions and households; how each provider resolves identity across people, devices and households; the coverage estimates for various channels; how OTA is measured; how Smart TV and STB data are commingled; and how each vendor measures diverse audiences. The goal is to revise the RFI, send it to the vendors, follow up with in-depth phone interviews and hopefully complete the guide by June.

OPENING FIRESIDE CHAT: Collaboration in Converged TV Measurement

Brian Steinberg, Senior TV Editor, Variety interviewed David Levy, CEO of OpenAP who gave an update on recent initiatives including XPm and investment from Discovery Communications. David reviewed that since its inception OpenAp has primarily been about taking a set of household IDs and applying them to TV data to create advanced audiences using both first and third party data that can then be activated across all TV networks. The launch of XPm now enables measurement of those campaigns to also include digital media via cross-platform identifiers. David also emphasized that OpenAP works with all TV networks, even if not all of them are investors.

The goal of XPm is to improve the ability of marketers to deduplicate reach and frequency across all devices and platforms. These data will also improve the consumer experience by giving marketers rapid feedback on campaign delivery and the ability to optimize the frequency and sequencing of ads to different consumers based on interoperable IDs. David recognized that events such as the Super Bowl are still important to the TV industry with their ability to attract large mass audiences, but that with privacy-safe identity resolution, marketers will know which homes were reached to enable better planning going forward. XPm also enables OpenAP to integrate multiple third party measurement and data providers that can be selected by the network or cients. OpenAP aims to bring new marketing intelligence to the buying and selling of cross-network, cross-platform TV ad campaigns.

UPDATE ON CIMM's DATA MATCHING STUDY: Status Report

Jim Spaeth, Partner at Sequent Partners, provided an update on CIMM's study of Data Matching among identity providers. He first explained the importance of understanding the impact of data matching, since the process can introduce unknown bias into the matched dataset. Then he shared the study design, which is to match Smart TV and STB data against eight ID providers and then examine the differences in viewing patterns, demographics, and outcomes. Jim explained that there has been a pre-phase to procure participation from all the vendors, which is now almost complete. He also highlighted some of the learning to date, such as understanding all the various match keys, assessing the approaches to quality assurance and privacy, resolving issues with both IP address and household address as match keys, and the primacy of Experian as the first privacy-compliant step for many providers of STB data. These learnings and more are detailed in an interim report that is currently being reviewed by CIMM, prior to sharing with all the members.

BUILDING BLOCKS FOR CONVERGED TV MEASUREMENT: Identity Resolution

Following Jim's overview of the Data Matching Study, Alice Sylvester, Partner at Sequent Partners, moderated a panel among some of the key providers of identity resolution services, including Max Parris, Head of Identity Resolution Product at Liveramp; Aimee Irwin, SVP, Strategy & Partnerships at Experian Marketing Services; Allyson Dietz, Director, Product Marketing at Neustar, A Transunion Company; and Tim Jenkins, EVP, Head of Audience & Identity Solutions at Cadent. Alice's panel not only highlighted the importance of ID resolution in the emerging Converged TV ecosystem, but also provided a wealth of insights into how identity and data matching work, especially when a marketer's first party data is enhanced through ID matching to a multitute of other datasets for various use cases from audience creation to post-campaign measurement of outcomes.

One panelist commented that no dataset is 100% accurate, so there is a lot of cleaning and data science algorithms and models that go into data curation. Even the definition of a household is evolving as logins to streaming apps allow extended viewing on different devices and by different individuals in different geographical locations. Additionally, panelists pointed out that their customers provide feedback on how well the data performed for particular use cases, which is then fed back into cleaning and matching. Panelists discussed the role of clean rooms and other privacy-compliant methods for securely sharing customer data, even within walled gardens, and the need for consumers to better understand how to permission the use of their data. Most panelists agreed that the process of identity resolution across households, individuals and devices involves both art and science, and that no dataset on the planet will ever be "perfect," especially as technology and consumer behavior continue to evolve. Smart people will still be needed to adapt data science algorithms to accurately reflect the continued introduction of new technology and the resultant changes in human behavior.

NEW CAPABILITIES FROM TV OEMS AND OS: How will they fit in or change the future?

Gerard Broussard of Pre-Meditated Media moderated a panel about CTV data and advertising that included Dan Robbins, VP, Ad Marketing & Partner Solutions, Roku; Justin Fromm, Head of Research, LG Ads Solutions; James Alexander, Direcor, Inscape Data Products & Research, VIZIO; and Maggie Zhang, Head of Measurement Success, Amazon Ads. Panelists began by describing their sources of ad inventory

which include all the new FAST channels on their various apps, shared inventory on partner apps, as well as welcome screen banner ads and the ability to place ads on other household devices via their ID graphs.

Maggie pointed out how Amazon can use their sales, viewing and listening data to create audience segments. Additionally, as part of campaign performance measurement, they can provide branded search data as a proxy for awareness. Dan emphasized that alongside their large ACR dataset that's linked to identity, Roku can conduct surveys on screen as part of campaign effectiveness measurement. He also said Roku is moving towards CPA (Cost Per Acquisition) terms with their advertisers. Justin reiterated that the potential of full funnel measurement for TV advertising is now being achieved with Smart TV data. LG Ads can build audiences and tie them to outcomes, using identity to link to offline and online outcomes. James closed by saying that VIZIO has built a nationally representative panel of ACR data from their footprint of Smart TVs, which they are evolving with the application of appropriate weights and demographic estimates for viewers and co-viewing. All the companies indicated they aren't currently pursuing any areas of collaboration between them.

CLOSING DISCUSSION: Buyers and Sellers Debate One Currency vs. Many

Joe Mandese, Editor of MediaPost moderated a discussion between Kelly Metz, Managing Director, Advanced TV Activation, Omnicom Media Group and Katrina Cukaj, Lead, Ad Sales & Client Partnerships, WarnerMedia. To start with, Kelly and Katrina mutually agreed that a "currency" is any transaction metric that is mutually agree-upon between a buyer and a seller – with Kelly's addition that it be validated by a neutral third party. Joe asked the panelists how the 2022 Upfront will work if there isn't any accredited currency. Both panelists agree that it's not that big a challenge to transact on multiple currencies, since it already occurs now with buying impressions across digital media and GRPs for TV. Additionally, they pointed out that Nielsen hasn't been able to accurately reflect consumer behavior for at least a couple of years, so it's time to measure the full value of every platform and every consumer.

Katrina said that WarnerMedia has not only been testing alternative currency providers, but also conducting a Listening Tour of agencies to make sure new measurement will meet the needs of clients. Kelly is looking forward to guaranteeing on advanced audiences, and also hoping to manage frequency better across platforms. Both panelists applauded the efforts of industry consortiums to solve for measurement, but made the pragmatic point that they aren't able to wait for industry standards and accreditation, but need to push ahead in 2022 to test and learn directly between each buyer and seller. Hopefully the industry will coalesce around standards provided by a few vendors that can then be audited by the MRC before the 2023 Upfronts. Somewhat surprisingly, both the buyers and sellers on this panel are willing to push ahead with potentially imperfect measurement in 2022, in order to expedite more accurate measurement by next year – making the point that transitions in currency can take time for full implementation.

THE LAST WORD: Closing Remarks

Jane Clarke, CIMM's CEO & Managing Director since its inception in 2010, provided her final insights on progress in converged TV measurement. She answered the question as to why she is retiring now, just as alternative measurement is getting traction, by saying that this is what is enabling her to retire now! CIMM's role for the past 12 years has been to advocate for innovation and competition in alternate methods to measure converged TV, and Jane is pleased that new solutions are finally gaining traction. She encouraged all industry players to continue to collaborate, share knowledge and work towards mutually beneficial solutions rather than succumb to partisan divisions. Jane looks forward to watching the media industry progress, but now as a consumer in front of her TV set.